

## A Details from section 2

*Proof of Lemma 1.* By definition we have

$$\begin{aligned}\mathcal{R}_T(\mathbf{u}) &= \sum_{t=1}^T \langle \mathbf{w}_t - \mathbf{u}, \mathbf{g}_t \rangle = \sum_{t=1}^T \langle \mathbf{z}_t, \mathbf{g}_t \rangle (v_t - \|\mathbf{u}\|) + \|\mathbf{u}\| \sum_{t=1}^T \langle \mathbf{z}_t - \frac{\mathbf{u}}{\|\mathbf{u}\|}, \mathbf{g}_t \rangle \\ &= \mathcal{R}_T^Y(\|\mathbf{u}\|) + \|\mathbf{u}\| \mathcal{R}_T^Z\left(\frac{\mathbf{u}}{\|\mathbf{u}\|}\right).\end{aligned}$$

□

## B Details from section 3

*Proof of Theorem 2.* For any fixed  $\mathbf{u} \in \mathcal{W}$ , let  $r = \max_{\frac{r'\mathbf{u}}{\|\mathbf{u}\|} \in \mathcal{W}} r'$ . Note that by definition we have  $\frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} \in [0, 1]$  and  $\frac{r\mathbf{u}}{\|\mathbf{u}\|} \in \mathcal{W}$ . Therefore, similar to the proof of Lemma 1, we decompose the regret against  $\mathbf{u}$  as:

$$\mathcal{R}_T(\mathbf{u}) = \sum_{t=1}^T \langle \mathbf{w}_t - \mathbf{u}, \mathbf{g}_t \rangle = \sum_{t=1}^T \langle \mathbf{z}_t, \mathbf{g}_t \rangle \left( v_t - \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} \right) + \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} \sum_{t=1}^T \langle \mathbf{z}_t - \frac{r\mathbf{u}}{\|\mathbf{u}\|}, \mathbf{g}_t \rangle,$$

which, by the guarantees of  $\mathcal{A}_Y$  and  $\mathcal{A}_Z$ ,<sup>3</sup> is bounded in expectation by

$$\tilde{O}\left(\frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} L\sqrt{T} + \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} dL\sqrt{T}\right).$$

Finally noticing  $\frac{1}{c} \leq r$  by the definition of  $c$  finishes the proof.

□

## C Details from section 4

*Proof of Lemma 3.* Denote by  $\tilde{\mathbf{w}}_t = v_t \mathbf{z}_t$ . By Jensen's inequality we have

$$\begin{aligned}\sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t(\mathbf{u})] &= \mathbb{E} \left[ \sum_{t=1}^T \ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t(\mathbf{u}) \right] + \sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{w}_t)] \\ &\leq \sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t(\mathbf{u})].\end{aligned}\tag{5}$$

We now continue under the assumption that  $\ell_t$  is  $L$ -Lipschitz. After completing the proof of the first equation of Lemma 3 we use the  $\beta$ -smoothness assumption to prove the second equation of Lemma 3.

<sup>3</sup>Note that the condition  $|\langle \mathbf{z}_t, \mathbf{g}_t \rangle| \leq 1$  in Algorithm 4 indeed holds in this case since  $\mathcal{Z} = \mathcal{W} \subseteq \mathbb{B}$  and  $\|\mathbf{g}_t\|_2 \leq L$  by the Lipschitzness condition.

Using the  $L$ -Lipschitz assumption we proceed:

$$\begin{aligned}
\sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t(\mathbf{u})] &\leq \sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{u})] + \sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{u}) - \ell_t(\mathbf{u})] \\
&\leq \sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{u})] + \mathbb{E}[L|v_t| \|\delta \mathbf{s}_t\|_2] \\
&\leq \sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{u})] + \mathbb{E}[\delta L|v_t|] \\
&= \sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t^{v_t}(\tilde{\mathbf{w}}_t) - \ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{u})] + \mathbb{E}[\delta L|v_t|] \\
&\quad + \sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t^{v_t}(\tilde{\mathbf{w}}_t)] \\
&\leq \sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t^{v_t}(\tilde{\mathbf{w}}_t) - \ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{u})] + 2 \mathbb{E}[\delta L|v_t|].
\end{aligned}$$

Now, by using the  $L$ -Lipschitz assumption once more we find that

$$\sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t^{v_t}((1-\alpha)\mathbf{u}) - \ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{u})] \leq \alpha \|\mathbf{u}\|_2 TL \tag{6}$$

By using equation (6), the convexity of  $\ell_t^{v_t}$ , and Lemma 2 we continue with:

$$\begin{aligned}
\sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t(\mathbf{u})] &\leq \sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\langle \tilde{\mathbf{w}}_t - (1-\alpha)\mathbf{u}, \hat{\mathbf{g}}_t \rangle] + 2 \mathbb{E}[\delta L|v_t|] + \alpha \|\mathbf{u}\|_2 TL \\
&= \sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} \left[ \left( v_t - \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} \right) \langle \mathbf{z}_t, \hat{\mathbf{g}}_t \rangle \right] + \mathbb{E} \left[ \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} \langle \mathbf{z}_t - \tilde{\mathbf{u}}, \hat{\mathbf{g}}_t \rangle \right] \\
&\quad + \sum_{t=1}^T 2 \mathbb{E}[\delta L|v_t|] + \alpha \|\mathbf{u}\|_2 TL \\
&= \sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} \left[ \bar{\ell}_t(v_t) - \bar{\ell}_t \left( \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} \right) \right] + \sum_{t=1}^T \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} \mathbb{E} [\langle \mathbf{z}_t - \tilde{\mathbf{u}}, \hat{\mathbf{g}}_t \rangle] \\
&\quad + 2T\delta L \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} + \alpha \|\mathbf{u}\|_2 TL
\end{aligned}$$

where  $\bar{\ell}_t(v) = v \langle \mathbf{z}_t, \hat{\mathbf{g}}_t \rangle + 2\delta L|v|$  as defined in Algorithm 5,  $\tilde{\mathbf{u}} = \frac{r}{\|\mathbf{u}\|} (1-\alpha)\mathbf{u}$ , and  $r > 0$  is such that  $\frac{r}{\|\mathbf{u}\|} \in \mathcal{Z}$ .

Finally, by using the convexity of  $\bar{\ell}_t$ , plugging in the guarantee of  $\mathcal{A}_V$ , and using Theorem 6 we conclude the proof of the first equation of Lemma 3:

$$\begin{aligned}
&\sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t(\mathbf{u})] \\
&\leq 2T\delta L \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} + \mathbb{E} \left[ \sum_{t=1}^T \left( v_t - \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} \right) \partial \bar{\ell}_t(v_t) \right] + \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} \mathbb{E} \left[ \sum_{t=1}^T \langle \mathbf{z}_t - \tilde{\mathbf{u}}, \hat{\mathbf{g}}_t \rangle \right] + \alpha \|\mathbf{u}\|_2 TL \\
&= \tilde{O} \left( 1 + T\delta L \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} + \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} L_V \sqrt{T} + \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\| dL}{r\delta} \sqrt{T} + \alpha \|\mathbf{u}\|_2 TL \right).
\end{aligned}$$

Next, we continue from equation (5) under the smoothness condition. Using the definition of smoothness we find

$$\begin{aligned}
\sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t(\mathbf{u})] &\leq \sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{u})] + \sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{u}) - \ell_t(\mathbf{u})] \\
&\leq \sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{u})] + \mathbb{E} \left[ \frac{1}{2} \beta |v_t|^2 \|\delta \mathbf{s}_t\|_2^2 \right] \\
&= \sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{u})] + \mathbb{E} \left[ \frac{1}{2} \delta^2 |v_t|^2 \beta \right] \\
&= \sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t^{v_t}(\tilde{\mathbf{w}}_t) - \ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{u})] + \mathbb{E} \left[ \frac{1}{2} \delta^2 |v_t|^2 \beta \right] \\
&\quad + \sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t^{v_t}(\tilde{\mathbf{w}}_t)] \\
&\leq \sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t^{v_t}(\tilde{\mathbf{w}}_t) - \ell_t^{v_t}(\mathbf{u})] + \mathbb{E} [\beta \delta^2 |v_t|^2].
\end{aligned}$$

Using equation (6), the convexity of  $\ell_t^{v_t}$ , and Lemma 2 we continue with:

$$\begin{aligned}
&\sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t(\mathbf{u})] \\
&\leq \sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\langle \tilde{\mathbf{w}}_t - (1-\alpha)\mathbf{u}, \hat{\mathbf{g}}_t \rangle] + \mathbb{E} [\beta \delta^2 |v_t|^2] + \alpha \|\mathbf{u}\|_2 TL \\
&= \sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} \left[ \left( v_t - \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} \right) \langle \mathbf{z}_t, \hat{\mathbf{g}}_t \rangle \right] + \mathbb{E} [\beta \delta^2 |v_t|^2] + \sum_{t=1}^T \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} \mathbb{E} [\langle \mathbf{z}_t - \tilde{\mathbf{u}}, \hat{\mathbf{g}}_t \rangle] + \alpha \|\mathbf{u}\|_2 TL \\
&= T\beta\delta^2 \left( \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} \right)^2 + \sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} \left[ \bar{\ell}_t(v_t) - \bar{\ell}_t \left( \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} \right) \right] + \sum_{t=1}^T \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} \mathbb{E} [\langle \mathbf{z}_t - \tilde{\mathbf{u}}, \hat{\mathbf{g}}_t \rangle] + \alpha \|\mathbf{u}\|_2 TL,
\end{aligned}$$

where  $\bar{\ell}_t(v) = v \langle \mathbf{z}_t, \hat{\mathbf{g}}_t \rangle + \beta \delta^2 v^2$  as defined in Algorithm 5. Finally, by using the convexity of  $\bar{\ell}_t$ , plugging in the guarantee of  $\mathcal{A}_\nu$ , and using Theorem 6 we conclude the proof:

$$\begin{aligned}
&\sum_{t=1}^T \mathbb{E} [\ell_t(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t(\mathbf{u})] \\
&\leq T\beta\delta^2 \left( \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} \right)^2 + \mathbb{E} \left[ \sum_{t=1}^T \left( v_t - \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} \right) \partial \bar{\ell}_t(v_t) \right] + \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} \mathbb{E} \left[ \sum_{t=1}^T \langle \mathbf{z}_t - \tilde{\mathbf{u}}, \hat{\mathbf{g}}_t \rangle \right] + \alpha \|\mathbf{u}\|_2 TL \\
&= \tilde{O} \left( 1 + T\beta\delta^2 \left( \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} \right)^2 + \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} L_\nu \sqrt{T} + \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} \frac{dL}{\delta} \sqrt{T} + \alpha \|\mathbf{u}\|_2 TL \right).
\end{aligned}$$

□

**Theorem 6.** Suppose that  $\ell_t(\mathbf{0}) = 0$ , that  $\ell_t$  is  $L$ -Lipschitz for all  $t$ , and that  $\mathcal{Z} \subseteq \mathbb{B}$ . For  $\mathbf{u} \in (1-\alpha)\mathcal{Z}$ , Online Gradient Descent on  $(1-\alpha)\mathcal{Z}$  with learning rate  $\eta = \sqrt{\frac{\delta^2}{(dL)^2 4T}}$  satisfies

$$\mathbb{E} \left[ \sum_{t=1}^T \langle \mathbf{z}_t - \mathbf{u}, \hat{\mathbf{g}}_t \rangle \right] \leq 2 \frac{dL}{\delta} \sqrt{T}.$$

*Proof.* The proof essentially follows from the work of Zinkevich [27], Flaxman et al. [13] and using the assumptions that  $\ell_t(\mathbf{0}) = 0$  and that  $\ell_t$  is  $L$ -Lipschitz. We start by bounding the norm of the

gradient estimate:

$$\begin{aligned}
\|\hat{\mathbf{g}}_t\|_2 &= \frac{d}{v_t \delta} |\ell_t(\mathbf{w}_t)| \|\mathbf{s}_t\|_2 \\
&= \frac{d}{v_t \delta} |\ell_t(v_t(\mathbf{z}_t + \delta \mathbf{s}_t)) - \ell_t(\mathbf{0})| \\
&\leq \frac{dL \|\mathbf{z}_t + \delta \mathbf{s}_t\|_2}{\delta} \leq \frac{dL(1 - \alpha + \delta)}{\delta}
\end{aligned} \tag{7}$$

By using equation (7) and the regret bound of Online Gradient Descent [27] we find that

$$\begin{aligned}
\sum_{t=1}^T \langle \mathbf{z}_t, \hat{\mathbf{g}}_t \rangle - \min_{\mathbf{z} \in (1-\alpha)\mathcal{Z}} \sum_{t=1}^T \langle \mathbf{z}, \hat{\mathbf{g}}_t \rangle &\leq \frac{(1-\alpha)}{2\eta} + \frac{\eta}{2} \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{\mathbf{g}}_t\|_2^2 \\
&\leq \frac{(1-\alpha)}{2\eta} + \frac{\eta}{2} \left( \frac{dL(1-\alpha+\delta)}{\delta} \right)^2 T \\
&\leq \frac{1}{2\eta} + 2\eta \left( \frac{dL}{\delta} \right)^2 T
\end{aligned}$$

Plugging in  $\eta = \sqrt{\frac{\delta^2}{(dL)^2 4T}}$  completes the proof.  $\square$

### C.1 Details of section 4.1

*Proof of Theorem 3.* First, since  $\ell_t(\mathbf{0}) = 0$ ,  $\ell_t$  is  $L$ -Lipschitz, and  $\mathbf{z}_t \in (1-\alpha)\mathcal{Z} = (1-\alpha)\mathbb{B}$  we have that

$$\langle \mathbf{z}_t, \hat{\mathbf{g}}_t \rangle \leq \|\mathbf{z}_t\|_2 \|\hat{\mathbf{g}}_t\|_2 \leq (1-\alpha) \frac{dL(1-\alpha+\delta)}{\delta} \leq \frac{2dL}{\delta}, \tag{8}$$

where the first inequality is the Cauchy-Schwarz inequality and the second is due to equation (7). Since  $|\partial \bar{\ell}_t(v_t)| \leq |\langle \mathbf{z}_t, \hat{\mathbf{g}}_t \rangle| + 2\delta L = L_V$  we can use Lemma 3 to find

$$\mathbb{E}[\mathcal{R}_T(\mathbf{u})] = \tilde{O} \left( \delta T L \|\mathbf{u}\| + \|\mathbf{u}\| \frac{dL}{\delta} \sqrt{T} + \alpha T L \|\mathbf{u}\|_2 \right).$$

Plugging in  $\alpha = 0$  and  $\delta = \min\{1, \sqrt{dT}^{-\frac{1}{4}}\}$  completes the proof.  $\square$

*Proof of Theorem 4.* By equation (8)  $|\langle \mathbf{z}_t, \hat{\mathbf{g}}_t \rangle| \leq \frac{2dL}{\delta}$ . Since  $v_t \leq \frac{1}{\delta^3}$  we have that

$$|\partial \bar{\ell}_t(v_t)| \leq \frac{dL}{\delta} + 2|v_t| \beta \delta^2 \leq \frac{dL + 2\beta}{\delta} \leq \frac{\beta(dL + 2)}{\delta}$$

If  $\|\mathbf{u}\|_2 \leq \frac{1}{\delta^3}$  applying Lemma 3 with  $\alpha = 0$  gives us

$$\mathbb{E} \left[ \sum_{t=1}^T \ell_t(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t(\mathbf{u}) \right] = \tilde{O} \left( 1 + T\beta\delta^2 \|\mathbf{u}\|^2 + \|\mathbf{u}\| \frac{dL\beta}{\delta} \sqrt{T} \right). \tag{9}$$

If  $\|\mathbf{u}\|_2 > \frac{1}{\delta^3}$  then using the Lipschitz assumption on  $\ell_t$  and equation (9) with  $\mathbf{u} = \mathbf{0}$  gives us

$$\begin{aligned}
\mathbb{E} \left[ \sum_{t=1}^T \ell_t(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t(\mathbf{u}) \right] &= \mathbb{E} \left[ \sum_{t=1}^T \ell_t(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t(\mathbf{0}) + \ell_t(\mathbf{0}) - \ell_t(\mathbf{u}) \right] \\
&= \tilde{O}(1 + \|\mathbf{u}\|_2 L T) \\
&= \tilde{O}(1 + \|\mathbf{u}\|_2^2 \delta^3 L T),
\end{aligned} \tag{10}$$

where we used that  $\|\mathbf{u}\|_2 \geq \frac{1}{\delta^3}$ . Adding equations (9) and (10) gives

$$\mathbb{E} \left[ \sum_{t=1}^T \ell_t(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t(\mathbf{u}) \right] = \tilde{O} \left( 1 + \|\mathbf{u}\|_2^2 \delta^3 L T + T\beta\delta^2 \|\mathbf{u}\|^2 + \|\mathbf{u}\| \frac{\beta dL}{\delta} \sqrt{T} \right)$$

Setting  $\delta = \min\{1, (dL)^{1/3}T^{-1/6}\}$  gives us

$$\mathbb{E} \left[ \sum_{t=1}^T \ell_t(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t(\mathbf{u}) \right] = \tilde{O} \left( 1 + \max\{\|\mathbf{u}\|^2, \|\mathbf{u}\|\} \beta (dLT)^{\frac{2}{3}} + \max\{\|\mathbf{u}\|_2^2, \|\mathbf{u}\|\} dL^2 \beta \sqrt{T} \right).$$

□

## C.2 Details of section 4.2

*Proof of Theorem 5.* First, to see that  $\mathbf{z}_t + \delta \mathbf{s}_t \in \mathcal{W}$  recall that by assumption  $\mathcal{W} \subseteq \mathbb{B}$ . Since  $\alpha = \delta$  we have that  $\mathbf{z}_t + \delta \mathbf{s}_t \in (1 - \alpha)\mathcal{W} + \delta \mathbb{S} \subseteq (1 - \delta)\mathcal{W} + \delta \mathcal{W} = \mathcal{W}$ . For any fixed  $\mathbf{u} \in \mathcal{W}$ , let  $r = \max_{\frac{r'\mathbf{u}}{\|\mathbf{u}\|} \in \mathcal{W}} r'$ . Note that by definition we have  $\frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} \in [0, 1]$  and  $\frac{r\mathbf{u}}{\|\mathbf{u}\|} \in \mathcal{W}$ . By using equation (8) we can see that  $|\partial \bar{\ell}_t(v_t)| \leq \frac{dL}{\delta} + 2\delta L$ . By definition,  $\frac{1}{r} \leq c$ . This implies that the regret of  $\mathcal{A}_\gamma$  is  $\tilde{O} \left( 1 + \frac{\|\mathbf{u}\|}{r} \frac{dL}{\delta} \sqrt{T} \right)$ . Applying Lemma 3 with the parameters above we find

$$\mathbb{E} \left[ \sum_{t=1}^T \ell_t(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t(\mathbf{u}) \right] = \tilde{O} \left( 1 + (\|\mathbf{u}\|_2 + c\|\mathbf{u}\|)TL\delta + c\|\mathbf{u}\|\delta L\sqrt{T} + c\|\mathbf{u}\|\frac{dL}{\delta}\sqrt{T} \right).$$

Finally, setting  $\delta = \min\{1, \sqrt{dT}^{-1/4}\}$  completes the proof:

$$\mathbb{E} \left[ \sum_{t=1}^T \ell_t(\mathbf{w}_t) - \ell_t(\mathbf{u}) \right] = \tilde{O} \left( 1 + (\|\mathbf{u}\|_2 + c\|\mathbf{u}\|)\sqrt{dT}^{3/4} + c\|\mathbf{u}\|dL\sqrt{T} \right).$$

□